## INDEX OF WITNESSES CHRONOLOGICALLY DEFENDANT JOHANNES MEHSERLE: E X A M I N A T I O N V/D CROSS REDIR RECRS DIRECT ANTHONY PIRONE INDEX OF WITNESSES АГРНАВЕТІСАГГУ DEFENDANT JOHANNES MEHSERLE: EXAMINATION CROSS REDIR RECRS V/DDIRECT ANTHONY PIRONE

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 3, 2009

DEPARTMENT 2

\_

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

THE COURT: All right. Counsel.

MR. RAINS: Good morning, your Honor.

THE COURT: Good morning.

MR. RAINS: Your Honor, if it pleases the Court. I was here at 8:30 to put matters on the record. I'd advised your clerk on Friday that we wanted to be here at 8:30 to put matters on the record concerning the Court's intended ruling on the duration of this proceeding. We were seated upstairs at 8:22 waiting to be brought down for that purpose. I would like to put those matters on the record at some time the morning.

THE COURT: It's time to do this witness. You'll get your opportunity witness by witness as the law requires. That's what you'll get.

I'm here. You know, I saw Mr. Allen was here, one of the lawyers I know who represents in the civil matter. I passed him at 7:40 standing there at the security gate. So to the extent the lawyers know. I told you what time to be here and you weren't here and downstairs. Let's go. We have a witness.

## DIRECT EXAMINATION RESUMED

BY MR. RAINS:

- Q. Officer Pirone, good morning.
- A. Good morning, sir.
- Q. Officer Pirone, I think when we recessed last week you had described your handcuffing of an individual named Michael Greer; is that correct?
  - A. Yes, sir.

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
	10
	11
	12
	13
	14
	15
	16
•	17
	18
	19
	20
	21
	22
	23
	24
	25
	26

2.8

- Q. Now, you were in the process of handcuffing Mr. Greer. And at that point in time, did you have any interaction with any of the other individuals who were against the wall?
  - A. Yes, I did.
- Q. First of all, do you know the name of any individuals you may have had interaction with?
  - A. Other than Oscar Grant, no, I do not.
- Q. You did have some kind of interaction with Oscar Grant?
  - A. That's correct, sir.
  - O. And describe what occurred.
- A. In the process of handcuffing Mr. Greer, I believe it was his right arm that I got handcuffed, at that time, Mr. Grant and two other individuals stood up and started advancing towards me with some cursing words.
  - Q. Mr. Grant stood up and started advancing toward you?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. And where were you when Mr. Grant started advancing towards you? Were you still dealing with Greer or were you up from dealing with Greer?
- A. I was still dealing with Mr. Greer. Again, I only had one hand handcuffed. I wasn't able to get the second one before I noticed Mr. Grant and two others stand up and start to come towards me, and I feared at that point as that was my next threat.
- Q. All right. Now, at that point in time when Mr. Grant and these other two individuals stood up, was Officer Domenici

in the area, if you recall?

- A. She was in the area.
- Q. All right. And when Mr. Grant stood up and started to approach you, did he say anything that you can recall?
  - A. Permission to speak freely, sir.

THE COURT: Absolutely.

THE WITNESS: Some of the words were: "Hey, you punk ass motherfucker. You can't do that. You're not even the real police. You're a fake police bitch." Something along those lines were the words that were coming out of his mouth.

BY MR. RAINS:

- Q. And what did you do as Mr. Grant stood, approached you and used those words?
- A. With my left hand I held a chain of the handcuff, and with the right hand I pointed at him and I told him to get back. "Get back against the wall. Sit down."
  - Q. Did he do that?
  - A. No, he did not.
  - Q. What happened next?
- A. I believe Officer Domenici came over and started to corral him back to where they were initially seated. At that time, I finished handcuffing Greer, gave him a quick pat search.
- Q. All right. And when you say a quick pat search, just tell us what that means.
- A. I check for any weapons in his immediate small of his back and his back pockets.
- Q. All right. And then after you did the pat search, what did you do next?

- A. I looked up and I see Grant and two -- of the two -the same two that were standing up with him. There were a total
  of three advancing towards Officer Domenici. What appeared to
  me, it looked like somebody was grabbing her left arm because in
  her right arm, I believe, she had a Taser out. At that point, I
  could see that as being a threat because she has three
  individuals advancing towards a uniformed officer with a weapon
  in her hand and not complying with the orders to get back and
  sit down.
  - O. So what did you do?
- A. Well, at that point, I got up and I went to address the situation, which was -- Mr. Grant seemed to be the leader of the aggression and I addressed him.
  - Q. How did you address Mr. Grant?
- A. When I came to step in front of Mr. Grant, he took a swing at me with his right arm, kind of stepped into it and absorbed it with my left arm, grabbed him and pushed him back up against the wall.
  - Q. Where did you grab?
  - A. Why did I grab him?
  - Q. Where, if you remember?
- A. In the upper shoulder, would be his left shoulder area.
  - Q. All right.
  - A. With my right hand.
  - Q. And you say you pushed him against the wall?
  - A. Correct.
  - Q. So you took your right hand and just made a pushing

motion? 1 Α. Yes. 2 And did he go back up against the wall? Q. 3 Yes, he did, sir. Α. 4 Did you say anything to him when you pushed him? 5 ο. I said, "Get back and sit down." Α. 6 All right. And what happened then? 0. 7 At that point, he made a couple of attempts to knee Α. 8 I think the second time he actually went me in the groin. 9 through with it. And at that point, I grabbed his arm, grabbed 10 him by the back of his head and bent him over. 11 Now, which -- if you remember, which hand did you use 12 to grab his arm? 13 I used my left hand to grab his right arm, pulled it Α. 14 that way and my right hand came up, pushed him back and I 15 grabbed the back of his neck. 16 And when you grabbed the back of his neck, did you 17 say you tried to bend him over? 18 Correct. Α. 19 Did you, in fact, bend him over? Ο. 20 Yes, sir. Α. 21 And when you bent him over, what did you do with him? 22 Q. Just held him down. Α. 23 All right. So you're holding him bent over at the Q. 24 waist at this point? 25 That's correct, sir. Α. 26 Do you remember was he standing at that time or was ο. 27

he in some other position when you had him bent over as you

~~~	1	described?	
1	2	Α.	He was still on his feet.
	3	Q.	All right. So you have him bent over and what's the
	4	next thing	that happened after you have him bent over?
	5	A.	I deploy my Taser.
	6	Q.	And when you say deploy your Taser, does that mean
•	7	you actuall	y used it?
	8	A.	No. I pulled it out of my holster, turned it on and
	9	point it ba	ck up, point it at him and told him to sit down.
	10	Q.	So you had a Taser with you that night?
	11	A.	Yes, I did.
	12	Q.	And which hand did you draw your Taser with?
	13	Α.	Left hand, sir.
~,	14	Q.	Is that the hand that you commonly use to draw your
)	15	Taser?	
	16	Α.	Yes, sir.
	17	Q.	Is that your strong hand?
	18	Α.	No, it is not.
	19	Q.	What does a strong hand mean to a police officer?
	20	Α.	Generally speaking, a strong hand is whatever hand
	21	you use to	fire your weapon, meaning your gun.
	22	Q.	So in your case, your gun was on which side of your
	23	duty bell?	
	24	Α.	I wear my duty weapon on my right side.
	25	Q.	And your Taser, what side of your duty belt is that
	26	on?	
~~~	27	A.	It's on the front of my right side in front of my
	28	weapon.	

5

6

7

8

9

25

26

27

- So if you are then drawing the Taser, how do you have to do that using your weak hand?
- It's what's considered a cross-draw. Take my left hand and come over. The reason why it's called cross because you cross the centerline of your body and deploy my Taser in such a fashion where I un-holster it, pull it out, turn it on and operate it with my weak hand.
- So, at that point in time, you had come out, you've Q. done the cross-draw, you came out with the Taser in your left hand and you're pointing at Mr. Grant?
- Correct. I stepped away after I pulled it out and had it on, stepped away, Mr. Grant stood back up, I pointed it at him and told him to sit down.
- I want to go back in time. I know you All right. 0. said you looked at some video of the events that night before testifying today, how many videos have you looked at, if you know?
  - I do not know. Α.
- Okay. Do you remember seeing any video where you ο. were seen to be pointing the Taser at the windows of a BART train with your right hand?
  - No, I do not. Α.
- To the best of your knowledge, did you hold the Taser Q. that night, if you held it during the course of the night, would you have held it in your weak hand?
  - Yes. Α.
  - To the best of your knowledge? Q.
  - Yes. Α.

Α.

28

Yes, sir.

were telling these people to sit down?

- A. She was addressing the multiple threats that were coming up from behind us.
- Q. So after these individuals are now seated, what's the next thing you do?
- A. Well, I specifically remember looking down that direction, meaning towards the south end -- actually, it's the north end of the platform, the back half of the train, because I can hear commotion. I'm not sure what exactly is being said. I heard curse words, different voices, different people, and I see people coming off of the train and some of them are coming at us.
- Q. And how many officers besides you and Domenici are there at that time?
  - A. None.
  - Q. Just you and Officer Domenici?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And when you see the people coming at you, you hear the curse words, what do you do?
  - A. I grab the radio and ask for more units.
- Q. All right. There's been some discussion, some testimony in this hearing, about some sort of an emergency button that officers have on their radios. Are you familiar with such a button?
  - A. Yes, I am.
  - O. And did you use that button that night?
  - A. No, sir, I did not.
  - Q. Why not?

A. Well, the button, I think, would have hindered radio traffic at that particular time. I knew I had more units coming. Just simply when I was walking up the stairs, I heard the other units responding and heading my direction.

When you press that button, it activates an emergency signal on your radio and it basically keeps the mic keyed up for approximately 5 to 10 seconds. I'm not sure. It's an approximation. I don't know the exact time. But it keeps the mic keyed up, so no one can make any radio transmissions at that point.

- Q. All right. But it doesn't automatically send people to your location?
  - A. People have to know where you are.
- Q. Do you remember -- so you get on the radio and you call for units, do you remember what you said? Do you have any recollection of that?
  - A. Not exactly. No, sir.
- Q. All right. You knew some units were already on the way?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. But you hadn't seen them?
  - A. Not yet, sir.
- Q. All right. After you make the radio transmission, what occurs?
- A. I look up and I see Officer Mehserle, Officer Woffinden and Officer Guerra coming our direction down the platform.
  - Q. To the best of your memory, are they walking? Are

they running?

- A. They're running, like a fast jog. Not a full blown sprint, but they're not walking.
  - O. Okay. What's the next thing that happens then?
- A. I believe it's Officer Guerra and Mehserle that come to exactly where I'm at and I tell them to watch subjects that are against the wall.
  - Q. All right. And what do you do?
- A. I go over to -- I make my way over to the train operator that's driving the train.
  - Q. Okay. Why did you go over there?
- A. That's where the call was -- that's where the call came from.
  - O. Call of the fight?
- A. The reporting party for that particular call was a train operator.
  - Q. Okay. So you went to talk to the train operator?
  - A. Correct.
  - Q. Did you, in fact, talk to the train operator?
  - A. Yes, sir, I did.
  - Q. About how long was your talk with the train operator?
- A. A couple of quick questions and a couple of quick responses. That's about how long it was. It wasn't a long conversation.
- Q. Based upon the talk that you had with the train operator, did you form any opinions as to whether the individuals that were detained against the wall had been involved in the fight?

۷,

A. Yes. I asked her what she had. My exact words were: "What do you have?" And she goes, "Those five that you pulled off the train were the five that were causing the problem on my train." I said, "Okay. What kind of problem?" She goes, "I'm not sure. I couldn't see. Crush load."

Crush load means there's standing remotely on the train. She couldn't really see throughout the entire train car. She just saw people on the seats. I said, "Okay. Well, has anyone else come forward to make complaint or say that they're hurt or need medical attention?" She said, "No." I said, "Okay. You should be getting your release here soon." Meaning, me releasing the train.

- Q. Meaning the train could drive on?
- A. Yes.
- Q. All right. Do you have anything to do with that release that's sent to the train to drive on? That is, do the police have something to do with that?
- A. It's somewhat of a protocol that when there's an incident on a train and they hold the train at a station platform, that the BART police release it when they're done conducting their investigation of that particular crime.
- Q. All right. So after you then had this discussion with her, what did you do?
- A. I started walking down back to the area of where the subjects were being detained. I started to look in the car as I was walking past the car, but my attention was drawn towards the north end of the platform because now the number of people was just getting larger that were coming off the train coming

towards the area where we had detained -- the subject detained. 1 All right. And as these individuals were coming off 2 the cars moving in the direction of where you have to subjects 3 detained, what were they doing? Yelling, cursing, things of that nature. 5 At the police, it appeared? Ο. 6 At the police. Α. 7 Do you remember any particular words hearing -- you Ο. 8 may have heard from this group that was coming off the train? 9 Yes, I do. Yes. Α. 10 What kind of words did you hear? Q. 11 Again, permission to speak freely, your Honor. A. 12 THE COURT: Yes. 13 "What are you doing niggers? You THE WITNESS: 14 niggers ain't shit. Why you messing with my cousins? 15 niggas ain't even real cops." Those types of things. 16 BY MR. RAINS: 17 All right. Was this repeated time and time again? 18 Q. Consistently. Α. 19 From your observation, about how many individuals do Ο. 20 you estimate were involved in the approach to that area in this 21 kind of language that you've described? 22 I don't know. Α. 23 THE COURT: Mr. Rains, hold on for a second. 24 (Pause.) 25 THE COURT: Go ahead. 26 BY MR. RAINS: 27 So as your attention is drawn to that part of the Q. 28

platform, hearing what you heard, seeing what you saw, what did you do?

- A. Stopped looking for anyone to contact on the lead car because there's no one that's come forward. The train's been there for a long time. My concern at first was is there someone bleeding out that's in need of medical attention. That's been made clear that there isn't anybody. I need to get that train out of here so I can get the number of people that are coming off of the train to decrease, if not go away.
- Q. All right. So you're concerned at that point in time is let's get this train out of here?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. And how did you try to do that?
- A. I went over the radio and transmitted release the train.
  - Q. Did that cause the train then to move away?
  - A. No, it did not.
- Q. What did you do after you went on the radio to release the train?
- A. Continued my way back down to where the location was the subjects were being detained was. I'm not sure which officer, whether it was Guerra or Officer Mehserle that asked me, "What do you got?" And at that particular time, I pointed to Mr. Greer on the ground and Mr. Grant, and I said, "He's going for 148 and he's going for 148."
- Q. Let me just stop for a minute. You say that you talked to either Mehserle or Guerra as you returned to this area where the individuals were detained?

1	1	A.	That's correct, sir.
	2	Q.	Were, to the best of your knowledge, Mehserle and
	3	Guerra sta	nding in close proximity to each other?
	4	A.	Yes, sir.
	5	Q.	All right. So you're talking to one of them, who you
	6	can't reca	ll now; is that right?
	7	A.	That's correct, sir.
	8	Q.	And you point at Mr. Greer whose on the ground and
	9	you say, "	He's under arrest or he's going for 148"?
	10	A.	Yes.
	11	Q.	Was that your words, "He's going for 148"?
•	12	A.	My words were, "He's going for 148." And I pointed
	13	to Mr. Gra	nt and my words again were, "He's going for 148."
	14	Q.	Now, what's 148?
	15	A.	148 is resisting, obstructing, arrest.
	16	Q.	And when you pointed at let's talk about Mr. Grant
	17	in particu	lar. You point at Mr. Grant and say, "He's going for
	18	148." How	far from Mr. Grant were you when you did that?
	19	Α.	Approximately from here to that podium right here in
	20	front of m	e.
	21		MR. RAINS: About 7 feet, your Honor.
	22		THE COURT: About 7 feet.
,	23		BY MR. RAINS:
	24	Q.	And the can you give us an idea of your voice?
	25	Was it spea	aking as you are now? Was with it louder than it is
	26	now?	
Juna	27	Α.	It was loud.
	28	. Q.	Why was it loud?

- A. There were many people yelling, screaming, everybody -- there was noise coming from everywhere. It felt like being in a crowd at a football game and somebody -- the home team scored a touchdown. That's how loud it was. You can almost feel the electricity from the noise level.
- Q. When you pointed at Mr. Grant and said, "He's going for 148," and you're about 7 feet from 'em, would you say you were yelling that information, "He's going for 148"?
- A. I'm sure I was speaking very loudly to get over that noise to speak to whoever it was that I was addressing.
- Q. All right. And so what's the next thing that happened after you said to either Guerra or Mehserle, "He's going for 148"?
- A. Mr. Grant started to stand up, I believe, and started to use more profanities.
- Q. All right. And when he started to stand up and use more profanity, what did you do?
- A. I addressed him. I saw him raising to his feet as another threat. Here he is again not following the very simple instructions to stay seated.
- Q. Now, at that point in time, Greer was already handcuffed, right?
  - A. Yes, he was.
- Q. So -- and at that point in time, as I understand your testimony, there was just two individuals that you had intended to arrest. And that was Greer and Grant; is that right?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. What about those other individuals that were detained

Do you remember -- and he's calling you names? Q. 1 Yes, sir. 2 Α. You remember any names? 3 Q. The other thing that I remember was his Α. Yes, sir. 4 hand was in his pocket as well. 5 Which hand? 6 Ο. His right hand was in his right front pant's pocket. 7 Do you remember seeing him using a cellar telephone Q. 8 at about this time? 9 No, sir. Α. 10 Did you see him come out of the pocket at any time 1.1 with a cellular telephone? 12 Α. No, sir. 13 So when you see his right hand in his -- or, yes, his 0. 14 right hand is in his right pant's pockets --15 Yes, sir. 16 Α. -- what did you do? What did you say? Q. 17 I yelled at him. Α. 18 What did you yell? 19 Q. "Hey, get your hands out of your pockets. Sit down." Α. 20 Did he get his hands out of his pocket? Q. 21 I don't remember how his hands came out of his Α. 22 I don't know if I took them out of his pocket or if he 23 pocket. took them out voluntarily. I don't remember. 24 All right. And did he sit down? 25 Q. Yes. Α. 26 What happened next? Ο. 27 I don't recall exactly the chain of events. 28 Α.

	1	pushed him down or if he sat down voluntarily. I don't
	2	remember.
	3	Q. You remember ever putting your knee against him at
	4	any time
	5	A. Yeah. Yes, I do.
	6	Q. When did that happen?
	7	A. At that time.
	8	Q. Okay. So you put your knees against him?
	9	A. Yes.
	10	Q. And what position was he in when you put your knees
	11	against him?
	12	A. At the time, he was standing up. And then I think
	13	what my intent was was to hit him in his hand on his thigh
	14	giving him a charley horse, because his hand was in his pocket.
	15	I was trying to distract him to where I could get that hand free
	16	because I have no idea what's in his pockets.
	17	Q. And when you say give him a charley horse, what do
	18	you mean by that?
	19	A. Drive my knee into the meaty portion of the thigh to
	20	cause a distraction blow for him to release his hand or whatever
	21	was in his hand that was in his pocket.
	22	Q. And do you remember actually connecting with your
	23	knee to his
	24	A. No, I do not.
	25	Q thigh?
	26	A. Never happened.
	27	Q. What did happen then?
	28	A. Because I think at that time I don't know if I was

push him down or if he sat down. Again, I don't recall the 1 exact chain of events of how it went down, but I remember 2 holding him down and pushing him down or something to that 3 effect and telling him to take his hands out of his pockets. 4 Okay. And did you hold him against the wall with 5 0. your knees, if you recall? 6 I don't recall. Α. 7 So now he's apparently back down after you've Ο. 8 told him to take the hand out of the pocket, right? 9 Α. Yes, sir. 10 And what's the next thing that happens, as you 1.1 recall? 12 He starts to use more profanities. Α. 13 Toward you? Ο. 14 Yes. He's looking right at me when he was speaking 15 16 to me. And what kind of profanities is he using as he's 17 looking right at you? 18 He called me a bitch ass nigger. Α. 19 All right. You'd heard that term during the course 20 of the night, right? 21 22 Α. Yes. Other people were using that kind of term, right? 0. 23 Yes, sir. 24 Α. And so he's calling you now a bitch ass nigger? Q. 25 Yes. Α. 26 And as he's doing that, what are you doing, if you ο. 27 28 recall?

I was just holding him down. Α. 1 All right. Just holding him down. Did you ever say 2 0. to him, "Sit the fuck down"? 3 Very well possibly, yes. 4 All right. You said you used profanity? Q. 5 A few times. Α. 6 And as Mr. Grant is referring to you with his racial 7 ο. slur and calling you this term that you've just described, did 8 you respond to him? 9 Well, I was in shock to be quite honest. 10 You're in shock that he's calling you this term 11 looking right at you? 12 Yes. Α. 13 And so you're in shock and my question is: 14 ο. remember saying something to him like, you know, "You calling me 15 a bitch ass nigger?" Anything like that? 16 I don't remember, but it very well may have happened. Α. 17 Is that something you would have All right. 18 Q. initiated on your own, calling him names? 19 No, I don't talk like that. A. 20 But he's talking to you like that? Q. 21 A. Yes, sir. 22 And if you would have used a term, it would have been Q. 23 in response to what he was yelling at you? 24 I'm not understanding the question. Α. 25 I mean, you know, you described what he's 26 0. saying to you and, you know, the effect it had on you. You say 27 if you would have used a term that included this racial term 28

that you just described, it would have been in response to him?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. But you don't have a recollection of doing that?
- A. No.
- Q. Have you tried to listen to or have you tried to listen to the videos and the audio portion to see if that's there?
- A. The only audio video that I've heard has been the Karina Vargas, I believe, video. The raw footage or whatever that's called. Every other video that I've seen has had no audio whatsoever.
- Q. So the only audio you've heard from anything you've looked at or listened to would have been audio from the Karina Vargas video?
- A. Yes, where you can actually hear Karina Vargas yelling, "Tase him," you know, that sort of thing.
- Q. So now he's yelling at you, you are dealing with him. What's the next thing you remember happening?
- A. There was some other dialogue and then Mehserle, I believe, came over and initiated contact with Grant.
- Q. Okay. Now, as you are dealing with Mr. Grant and he's yelling at you as you've described and, you know, whatever you're saying back to him is happening, do you know what Mehserle was doing at that time?
  - A. I have no idea.
- Q. Did you ever -- were you ever in a position to see

  Mehserle handcuffing Jackie Bryson -- strike that -- handcuffing
  another individual who was to the immediate left of Oscar Grant?

- A. Well, I had somebody's back. When I say somebody, I mean an officer. I'm not sure if it was Officer Guerra or if it was Officer Mehserle. If I'm in this position here with Oscar Grant in front of me on the floor holding him down, I had another police officer's back towards me or right here in front of me, in between myself or -- I'm sorry -- in between Oscar Grant and myself -- no. Scratch that. In between -- right after Oscar Grant, there was another officer's backside that was bent over dealing with somebody. Who that was or what they were doing, I don't know. I'm trying to deal with Oscar Grant and what's in his hands because that's, to me, posing a threat to me.
- Q. You as a police officer, is it dangerous to see people with their hands in their pocket?
  - A. Absolutely.
- Q. Had Mr. Grant been pat searched up to that point in time?
  - A. No, he had not.
- Q. And was there a reason why you had not taken the time to pat search him?
  - A. We were vastly outnumbered, sir.
  - Q. You did do a quick pat search of Mr. Greer?
  - A. He was on the ground being handcuffed, yes.
  - Q. But you hadn't been able to do that to Mr. Grant?
  - A. Or anyone else.
- Q. The right hand in the pocket, did that pose a threat to you, a physical threat?
  - A. Yes, it does.

	1	Q. And when you talk about threat, do you couple that
/	2	with the sort of combination of the interactions plus their
	3	outward demeanor?
	4	A. Yes.
	5	Q. Given what you saw Mr. Grant doing, saying and
	6	moving, did he appear to be a physical threat to you at that
	7	moment?
	8	A. Absolutely.
	9	Q. And so at some point in time you say there's an
	10	officer with his back to you, you don't know what he's doing,
	11	but at some point in time you see Mehserle move in and start to
	12	deal with Mr. Grant?
	13	A. Correct.
	14	Q. And when you first have this memory of seeing
)	15	Mehserle move in and start to deal with Mr. Grant, do you
	16	remember what was happening between you and Mr. Grant?
	17	A. Again, there was some dialogue.
	18	Q. Okay. Some yelling back and forth?
	19	A. Yes.
	20	Q. All right. And as Mehserle then moves in, what do
	21	you remember happening with Mr. Grant?
	22	A. Him going to the ground.
	23	Q. Okay. Do you remember how Mr. Grant was moved to the
	24	ground?
	25	A. No, not exactly. I don't remember.
	26	Q. Did you do that or did Mehserle?
	27	A. I initially thought I did, but when I was shown some
	28	video, it was proven to me that I was not the one who put Oscar

Grant on the ground. 1 Who was it? 2 Q. It was Officer Mehserle. 3 Α. Now, let me ask you this: Prior to January 1st, 4 2009, at about 2:00 in the morning, had you ever worked with 5 Officer Mehserle as partners? 6 Yes, sir, I have. 7 Α. About how many times? Q. 8 More than 10. I don't have a specific number. 9 Α. So working with partners you kind of get to know each 10 0. other's style and habits as a police officer? 11 Α. Yes. 1.2 So he wasn't a perfect stranger to you? 13 0. No, he was not. Α. 14 Was he just so we know, did you consider him a friend 15 Q. as of January 1st, 2009? 16 Yes, I did. Α. 17 Did you socialize with him away from work? 18 0. No, I did not. Α. 19 All right. So he was a guy that you knew at work, 20 you considered him a friend, and you've worked with him on maybe 21 10 occasions? 2.2 Α. Yes, sir. 23 Had you had any level of communication that night or Ο. 24 that morning, I guess I should say, with Mehserle about what was 25 happening after you saw him arrive? Had you talked to him at 26 all? 27 The first time I was Officer Mehserle is when Officer 28 Α.

Mehserle arrived on scene. 1 Okay. When he was running along with the other 2 officers? 3 That's correct, sir. Α. 4 And you hadn't talked to him since then? 5 Ο. No, sir. No. 6 Α. Other than maybe saying, "He's going for 148," 7 Q. pointing at Grant and you can't remember if you directed that to 8 Mehserle or to Guerra? 9 That's correct. 10 Α. So Mehserle moves Grant to the ground; is that right? 11 Ο. Yes, sir. Α. 12 And when he moved Mr. Grant to the ground, did Mr. 13 Grant go down as you recall in a compliant fashion? 14 No, sir. 15 Α. How did he go down? 16 I don't remember exactly how he went down, but his Α. 17 hands were at his waistband and I never saw his hands again. 18 When he went to the ground initially, when Mehserle Ο. 19 moved him to the ground, do you remember if Mr. Grant went down 20 on his back or on his stomach? 21 I don't remember. Α. 22 And when Mr. Grant went to the ground and Mehserle Ο. 23 moved him to the ground, what did you do? 24 I went and held the upper portion of his body. Α. 25 upper back and the head, held that down. 26 Where was Mehserle at that time? Ο. 27 The lower region of his body, the upper thighs/waist Α. 28

- area, I believe. When I looked back, Officer Mehserle was straddling Oscar Grant.
- Q. Could you tell what Mehserle was doing when you looked back?
- A. I don't remember if it was there or when I had to switch the other side because Oscar Grant was flopping around trying to get away and he got free from underneath me. I went back to the other side and held him down from his left side because at first I started on his right side. At some point in time I remember seeing Officer Mehserle with two hands tugging on Oscar Grant's right elbow.
- Q. All right. And were you holding Mr. Grant down at the upper body area when you saw that?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Can you describe for us how you were holding him down?
- A. With both hands. I was pushing down on his hand and upper back shoulder, shoulder blade area. I was knelt down and pushing down his body.
  - Q. Okay. Where were your knees?
- A. One was over the shoulder blade area of his back. The other one off to the side.
- Q. All right. So you actually have one of your knees, as you recall, in the shoulder blade area of his back?
  - A. Well, not at first, no.
  - Q. Okay. At first --
  - A. At first, I'm just holding him down with two hands.
  - Q. Okay. Okay. And then at some point in time the knee

		·	
)	1	moved to the shoulder blade area?	
	2	A. When I went to the other side, that's when I pu	t my
	3	weight, my knee, on his upper shoulder blade area.	
	4	Q. How long did you hold him down with your hands	before
	5	you may have changed the position you were in?	
	6	A. I don't know, but I changed my position because	he
	7	broke free.	·
	8	Q. He meaning?	
	9	A. Oscar Grant.	
	10	Q. And how did he break free?	
	11	A. I didn't have control of his upper body.	,
	12	Q. And what did he do to break free?	
	13	A. He was squirming around.	
٧,	14	Q. All right. So Mehserle is still tugging to get	his
)	15	hands; is that right?	
	16	A. Yes, sir.	
	17	Q. And was Oscar Grant struggling?	
	18	A. Yes, he was, the entire time.	
	19	Q. Was he moving?	
	20	A. Yes, he was.	
	21	Q. And while this is going on, were you saying anyt	hing
	22	to Oscar Grant?	
	23	A. I was ordering him to put his hands behind his b	oack.
	24	Q. How many times did you order him?	
	25	A. At least two times.	
	26	Q. Did you hear Officer Mehserle saying anything to	o Mr.
,	27	Grant?	
)	28	A. I heard Officer Mehserle repeating those same wo	rds.

~~~	1	Q.	"Put your hands behind your back"?
!	2	A.	Yes. Correct.
	3	Q.	More than once on Mehserle's part?
	4	A. :	More than one.
	5	Q.	So the two of you were yelling the same thing, "Put
	6	your hands l	oehind your back"?
	7	Α.	I believe that somebody was yelling, "Stop
	8	resisting."	
	9	Q.	And you think maybe that's Mehserle?
	10	Α.	Yes, but I don't know.
•	11	Q.	Okay. And you say you never saw him put his hands
	12	behind his b	pack?
	13	A. 3	Never.
~	14	Q. 2	And then at some point in time you said that Oscar
	15	Grant squir	ned out from under you?
	16	Α	That's correct, sir.
	17	Q	And then what did you do when he squirmed out from
	18	under you?	
	19	Α.	I repositioned myself to the other side, pushing him
	20	down, pushed	d him back down, and that's when I put both knees on
	21	the back.	
	22	Q. <i>i</i>	All right. And when you put both knees on his back,
	23	were you app	olying some of your weight to hold him down?
	24	Α. Α.	Absolutely.
	25	, Q	All right. Were you ever in a position that you can
	26	recall with	a single knee in the back area and the other leg out
· My	27	spread from	his body some way. Do you remember that?
)	28	A. :	I'd have to look at video for that because I don't

remember that off the top of my head. 1 Okay. Other than putting weight on his body using 2 both knees, you don't remember applying weight from your body 3 4 prior to that? 5 A. No. All right. And so now you've got both your knees on Ο. 6 his back, correct? 7 Yes, sir. Α. 8 And how much did you weigh on January 1st, 2009? 9 Ο. With or without my duty belt, sir? 10 Α. Let's do with. 0. 11 Approximately 250 pounds. 1.2 Okay. And so now you're on his back. What's 13 Mehserle doing, if you know, when you put the weight of your 14 body on his back with your knees? 15 He started yelling, "I'm going to tase him. Α. 16 going to tase him." 17 All right. And could you see if Mehserle had either 18 Ο. hand out from under him at that moment? 19 No, I did not. 20 Did it appear to you that either hand -- Mr. Grant's 21 hands was behind his back? 22 No, it did not. 23 Α. Had Mr. Grant done anything up to that point in time 24 -- well, strike that. 25 Had Mr. Grant ever said to you, "I give up"? 26 No, he did not. 27 Α. Had Mr. Grant ever said, "I'll give you my hands"? 28 Q.

A. No, he did not. 1 Did Mr. Grant ever say, "Please, just arrest me"? 2 Ο. No, he did not. 3 Α. Did Mr. Grant ever say anything that led you as an 4 0. officer to believe that he was giving up? 5 Α. No. Or that he was complying with your request to put his 7 Q. hands behind his back? 8 No, sir. 9 Α. What about his actions? Did anything about his 10 Ο. actions indicate to you that he was giving up? 11 Absolutely not. 12 Did anything about his actions indicate to you that 13 he wanted to put his hands behind his back to be handcuffed? 14 No. 15 Α. So Mehserle now says, "I'm going to tase you," right? Ο. 16 Twice. Α. 17 And when you hear that, how loud is Mehserle saying 18 0. that? 19 It sounds like he's yelling. 20 And from your own Taser training, are you supposed 21 to, if you know, are you supposed to alert other people that you 22 may deploy the Taser? 23 Yes, you are. A. 24 Why do you do that? 25 Q. I'm guessing to protect the officers that are nearby 26 Α. in the vicinity. 27 THE COURT: What do you mean you're guessing? 28

THE WITNESS: Well, because I can't speak for why 1 officers do that, sir. 2 That's what I want to know. You can't THE COURT: 3 speak for other officers, correct? 4 THE WITNESS: Yes. 5 THE COURT: Next question. 6 BY MR. RAINS: 7 The training says, before you deploy the Taser, 8 Ο. you're supposed to give a command or an alert? 9 Yes, sir. 10 Α. And so you're hearing Mehserle yell twice, "I'm going 11 to tase him, " right? 12 13 Α. Yes. And what's the next thing that happens when you hear ο. 14 Mehserle yell that twice? 1.5 He starts to yell, "Get back, get back." 16 Α. "Get back, get back"? Q. 17 Α. Yes, sir. 18 Is he using your name? Q. 19 He did after he said, "Get back, get back." Then he 20 yelled out, "Tony, Tony." And that's when I popped up. 21 Did anything that Mehserle said at this time purport 22 to narrate what was happening, what he was seeing, what he was 23 doing? Did he given you any indication? 24 At some point in time, I don't know when Mehserle was 25 Α. yelling, "His hands are in his waistband. His hands are in his 26 waistband. I can't get his hands. I can't get his hands." 27 Those words were being yelling from Mehserle. Exactly where in 28

the struggle, I don't know. It was before he said, "I'm going 1 to tase him." 2 So before he said he's going to tase him, he Ο. 3 was saying he couldn't get his hands? 4 Α. Correct. 5 And then he yells twice, "I'm going to tase him." Ο. 6 And then after that he says, "Get up"? 7 "Get back." Α. 8 "Get back"? Ο. 9 Α. Correct. 10 And then he yelled your name? 11 Ο. Α. Yes. 12 13 Q. What did he say? "Tony, Tony, get back." Α. 14 And when he said, "Tony, Tony, get back," what do you 15 Ο. remember doing? 16 I got up. I had no idea why I was getting up, but I 17 Α. 18 got up. Let me ask you something, Officer Pirone. You said 19 that Mr. Grant had called you a name that shocked you, and you 20 used the term "bitch ass nigger," correct? 21 Yes, sir. 22 Did you harbor any animus, that is, any hatred for 23 Mr. Grant for the things he called you? 24 No, sir. 25 Α. When Mr. Grant went to the ground, when Mehserle took 0. 26 him to the ground, do you remember if you took any actions to 27 try to prevent his head from striking the ground? 28

- A. I don't remember.
- Q. Let me go on from here, sir. So Mehserle is yelling at you, "Tony, get back, get back." Did you respond to that in some way?
  - A. Yes, I did. I got up.
  - Q. And when you got up, what do you remember happening?
  - A. Before I even stood erect, I heard a gunshot.
- Q. All right. And when you heard the gunshot, what did you do?
- A. Well, to be perfectly honest, I thought the Taser had malfunctioned because I was looking at Oscar Grant's back and I'm thinking I need to be -- I should be seeing probes. I'm not seeing any probes. What's going on? We just had a malfunction. And as all of that is going through my head, I look up and I see Officer Mehserle with a gun in his hand.
- Q. Now, you said you were looking down and thinking you should see probes. What does that mean?
- A. When the Taser is actually deployed and triggered, two probes that puncture the skin come out and penetrate the skin of the body. At that time, the actual mechanism -- I'm not sure the nomenclature -- inside the Taser sends out the voltage for approximately five seconds.
- Q. All right. So you're actually examining Mr. Grant's back at this time looking for the presence of these probes?
- A. At the end of the probes are very thin copper wires. So it's clear as day when probes are deployed.
  - Q. All right. And you didn't see any probes?
  - A. I did not see any probes.

- Q. Did you see anything else that you recognized right then in Mr. Grant's back?
  - A. I saw what looked like a black hole.
- Q. All right. And you say at that point in time you looked over at Mehserle and saw a gun in his hand?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. How did you know it was a gun as opposed to a Taser?
  - A. Because it looked like his gun.
- Q. All right. And where was he holding it, if you recall, in his hand when you first saw it? Was it at his side? Where was it?
  - A. I believe it was still pointed at Oscar Grant.
- Q. Where do you remember Officer Mehserle standing in relation to Oscar Grant when you first saw that gun pointed?
- A. At the lower portion of his body, at his feet, off to the side.
  - Q. Which side, if you remember?
- A. His left side. The same side that I was on when I stood up. I was standing -- if I stood up right here, Oscar is right here, Officer Mehserle was standing over here (indicating).
  - Q. And was the gun pointed directly down at his back?
  - A. Yes, it was.
- Q. And so at that point in time, what do you remember happening next?
- A. I believe -- again, excuse me, your Honor -- I think I said, "Oh shit."
  - Q. Okay. Why did you say, "Oh shit"?

It's not something that I was expecting to see or Α. 1 hear. 2 A qunshot? 0. 3 Α. Yes. 4 You expected to see or hear a Taser? 5 Q. That's correct, sir. 6 Α. And so when you said, "Oh shit," did you ever see 7 Q. Mehserle's face at about this time? 8 Α. Yes, I did. 9 Ο. Describe it. 10 It was a look of shock. Almost like if he had the 11 same thought, Oh shit. 12 All right. And so you say, "Oh shit," and what did 13 0. you do next? 14 Well, I'm thinking now I need to go from arrest mode 15 Α. to life-saving mode, because now I've got a gunshot victim on 16 the ground. 17 Could you smell the gun powder? 18 0. 19 I don't remember. Α. And so you got a gunshot victim on the ground. 20 Ο. What did you do? 21 I grabbed my radio and asked for Code 3 Medical. 22 I specifically remember telling dispatch to not have them stage. 23 Reason for that is because generally speaking when shots are 24 fired, AMR is not going to roll to your exact location until 25 they know or that you have cleared the scene or deemed it as 26 what is considered Code 4, which means safe. So I told them to 27 have them roll Code 3 Medical and not have them stage. 28

- a gunshot victim on platform two -- correction -- platform one.
- Q. In other words, you wanted to get this medical group there as quickly as possible?
  - A. I need -- yes, I need paramedics now.
- Q. All right. And after you requested this medical response, what did you do?
- A. I look up and Officer Mehserle's looking like he's lost. At that time, I no longer saw a gun in his hand. So I'm assuming he re-holstered. I told him -- as I was telling him to handcuff Oscar Grant, Oscar Grant started to get up. He put his left hand down on the pavement and started to do a pushup type move to try to erect himself or sit up, if you will. At that time, I told him, "Hey, relax. Get back down." And I told Officer Mehserle to handcuff him.
- Q. I want to go back in time just slightly, Officer Pirone. Up until the point in time that you heard the gunshot go off, had Mr. Grant ever stopped squirming and moving?
  - A. No. Not until the gunshot went off.
- Q. Up until that time that the gunshot went off, had you ever seen Mr. Grant engaging in actions that you, as an officer, believed were in compliance to your request that he put his hands behind his back?
  - A. No, he never did.
- Q. Do you believe at the time the gunshot went off that Mr. Grant had presented his hands behind his back to be handcuffed?
  - A. No, they were not there.
  - Q. So we go forward. You told Mehserle now to handcuff

27

28

Mr. Grant after he was shot?

- A. That's correct, sir.
- Q. Why did you do that?
- A. We still -- I still do not know at that particular time whether or not he does, in fact, have a weapon.
- Q. All right. And so you had him handcuff him. Did Mehserle handcuff him?
  - A. Yes, he did.
  - O. And what happened after Mr. Grant was handcuffed?
- A. I didn't watch Officer Mehserle handcuff Oscar Grant, because at that time there was somebody against the wall -- I'm not sure who it was -- who became very animated, started yelling and screaming, and I went to address him because again he has yet to be searched and he's literally at the feet of Oscar Grant.
  - Q. And did this individual appear to be angry?
  - A. He was angry, distraught, yes.
  - Q. All right. And how did you address this individual?
- A. I told him that he needed to calm down. I said, "You need to calm down so I can take care of your friend."
  - Q. All right. Did that individual calm down?
  - A. No, he did not.
  - Q. Do you know who that person is today?
  - A. I have no idea, sir.
- Q. Do you recall what his stature was like? Was he a big guy? A small guy?
  - A. He was heavyset.
  - Q. So what happened? He's not calming down. How are

you dealing with him?

- A. I'm trying to talk him down. I think maybe three or four times that conversation went through, and at some point I believe it was an Oakland police officer who came up and took control of that particular individual, and at that point I turned around and started requesting for more assistance.
  - O. Police assistance?
  - A. Correct, sir.
  - Q. Why were you requesting more police assistance?
- A. I just had an officer-involved shooting. I've got a gunshot victim on the ground. I asked for a supervisor and detectives.
- Q. And at that point in time, was the train still there at the station?
  - A. The train had left.
  - Q. By then, the train had left?
- A. By then, the train had left. Exactly where in the chain of events it left, I don't know.
- Q. All right. The train has now left. You're asking for more assistance. Did you attend at any time after that to Mr. Grant while he was on the ground?
- A. Not until after I made that request for more assistance.
- Q. And then after you made the request for more assistance, what did you do?
- A. I went over and sat down by Mr. Grant and stayed with him until AMR came and took him away.
  - Q. All right. What was Officer Mehserle doing at the

point in time when you turned your attention away from this 1 2 individual you were trying to get calmed down and then turned back to Mr. Grant? 3 As I was transmitting, he was following me. Α. Officer Mehserle was? 5 Ο. That's correct. Α. 6 7 He was kind of following you around? Q. Yes. 8 Α. And was he doing anything other than following you 9 around, as you recall? 10 He started to say something and I told him to wait 11 because I felt that I needed to get this transmission out. 12 Okay. So you got the transmission out. I assume 13 that's the one requesting more assistance? 14 15 Requesting for an L unit, which means Α. Yes. lieutenant and DD, which is an acronym for detectives. 16 And then after you got that transmission out, you 17 Q. 18 attended to Mr. Grant? 19 Α. Yes. Did you talk to Mehserle right after the 20 0. transmission? 21 As I was walking towards Mr. Grant, Mehserle stopped Α. 22 me and said, "Tony, I thought he was going for a gun." 23 All right. Anything else? 24 Q. 25 Α. No. And what did you say to Mr. Mehserle? 26 Q. A. I just said, "Okay." 27 And so then you took -- you attended to Mr. Grant? 28 Q.

1 Α. That's the next most important thing to me right now. 2 What did you do? Q. I just spoke with him. 3 Α. Did you give him CPR or anything like that? 4 Q. We don't give CPR for people that are conscious 5 Α. 6 and breathing. Okay. That's your training? 7 Ο. Α. Yes. 8 He was breathing? 9 0. I was talking to him. 10 Α. All right. And was the wound in the back, was that 11 Ο. bleeding profusely at the time? 12 But when Officer Guerra -- at some point, No. 13 Officer Guerra went downstairs to get a gunshot trauma kit, and 14 15 he came up and applied pressure to the back. All right. 16 Q. I think he rolled Mr. Grant over at some point, 17 Α. because once we deemed him safe, someone searched him. 18 know who, but we removed the handcuffs. And when Officer Guerra 19 rolled him over, you can see a shiny, what looked like a spent 20 round that had been smashed, a piece of lead protruding or 21 actually sitting on the shirt of Oscar Grant. 22 23 Q. And you're pointing to in this case --The right. A. 24 The right chest area? 25 Q. The upper right chest area. 26 Α. It appeared to be something shiny protruding --Q. 27 28 Yes, sir. Α.

- Q. And where did you go?
- A. To the Lake Merritt BART station.
- Q. After you got to the Lake Merritt BART station, sometime later that same day, did you give an interview to somebody?
  - A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Do you remember what time of day it was when you gave an interview?
  - A. I want to say late morning.
- Q. All right. Late morning. And when you gave an interview, had you been up a number of hours by then?
  - A. Yes. Yes, I had.
- Q. Following your interview that you gave sometime late morning of January 1st, 2009, were you interviewed on subsequent dates that you can recall?
  - A. Yes, I was.
  - Q. Couple of times?
  - A. Three to be exact, sir.
- Q. Officer Pirone, I know I've asked you a lot of questions about events that happened, it sounds like, in rapid succession. When you were first interviewed, had you remembered all of the events that transpired that night?
  - A. No, sir.
- Q. Did there come a point in time where you remembered for instance having some kind of a conversation with Mr. Grant about him having a child?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. First of all, what do you remember about the

conversation with Mr. Grant about him having a child? 1 MR. STEIN: Objection. Excuse me, your Honor. 2 Withdrawn. 3 4 THE COURT: You can answer. THE WITNESS: The question again. 5 BY MR. RAINS: 6 What do you remember about the conversation you had 7 Q. with Mr. Grant about him having a child? 8 I remember him telling me that he had a daughter, a Α. 9 10 four-year-old daughter. And when in relation to the evens that you've 11 testified to did that discussion occur? 12 I'm not sure exactly. 13 Α. All right. Had you remembered that discussion 14 Q. 15 occurring when you were first interviewed? I don't remember. I'd have to look at the transcript 16 Α. or listen to the tape. 17 Okay. But at some point you did remember that 18 0. happened? 19 Yes, sir. As a matter of fact, it was the last 20 Α. interview that I had with BART. 21 The last interview? 22 Q. 23 Α. I believe it was March 17th. All right. You remember what triggered in your mind 24 0. the fact that, you know, you'd had this conversation? 25 They showed me a video that I'd never seen before. 26 Α. 0. During the interview itself? 27 Yes, sir. 28 Α.

)	1	Q. All right. And it was that, the showing of that
	2	video you'd never seen before that triggered that recollection
	3,	in your mind?
	4	A. Yes.
	5	MR. RAINS: All right. Thank you, Officer Pirone. I
	6	don't think I have any other questions.
	7	THE COURT: We'll take a 15-minute recess.
	8	(Court in recess.)
	9	THE COURT: All right. Mr. Stein, cross-examination.
	10	CROSS-EXAMINATION
	11	BY MR. STEIN:
	12	Q. Officer Pirone, you testified that at no time did you
	13	ever see Oscar Grant with his hands behind his back in a cuffing
`\	14	position; is that true?
	15	A. If that's what I said, then yes, sir.
	16	Q. Is it true?
	17	A. I'm asking you. I don't understand the question.
	18	Q. Did you ever see Oscar Grant with his hands behind
	19	his back in a cuffing position?
	20	A. No, I did not.
	21	Q. I'd like to direct your attention to the monitor.
	22	Can you see that from where you are, sir?
	23	A. No. There's a horrible glare coming off of those
	24	windows.
	25	THE COURT: Officer Pirone, why don't you get over to
	26	where you need to see it. If you need to get closer, go ahead.
سمر	27	THE WITNESS: Right here, sir. I'm right in between
)	28	that glare.

28

BY MR. STEIN:

- Q. Can you see it clearly from where you are?
- A. His hands, sir?
- Q. No. Can you see the monitor from where you are without the glare. I'm going to play a clip of this and I just want you to be able to see it clearly while it's playing.
  - A. Go ahead.
- Q. For the record, I'm showing the Cross video, the first of three, starting at frame 2335.

(Video played.)

Q. I've stopped at frame 2474.

Officer Pirone, you said that after the shot you were looking for probes in the back of Oscar Grant's back. What do you see in this frame?

- A. What appears to be two hands.
- Q. In a cuffing position, true?
- A. I appears that way, yes, sir.
- Q. And do those hands appear to be those of Oscar Grant's, true?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And those hands are in exactly the area where you say you were looking for probes, true?
  - A. Well, I was looking for the probes in the back, sir.
  - O. And that's where his hands are, true?
- A. Those are at the small of his back, perhaps maybe in the buttocks, sir.
- Q. Do you think that when you were looking for probes in the back, that maybe you missed Oscar Grant's two hands behind

his back in a cuffing position? 1 I was looking for the probes, sir. 2 Ο. You can have a seat. 3 You've testified that you are friends with the defendant, 4 5 Johannes Mehserle; is that correct? Yes, sir. 6 Α. And on occasion you had worked together. I think you 7 Ο. said approximately 10 times, true? 8 9 Α. Yes, sir. You have said in the past that your relationship with 10 0. the defendant Johannes Mehserle is like a big brother 11 12 relationship; is that right? 13 Α. Yes, sir. And in that type of a big brother relationship, who's 14 the big brother? 15 16 Α. That would be me, sir. And as a big brother relationship, do you mean to 17 0. 18 imply that you are someone who is somewhat of a mentor to Mr. Mehserle like a big brother? 19 20 When it comes to work, yes. Α. When it comes to work. And when it comes to work, 21 Ο. did you mean to suggest that you are someone that Mr. Mehserle 22 maybe respects professionally? 23 MR. RAINS: That calls for speculation. 24 THE COURT: Overruled. Cross-examination. 25 If you know. If you don't know, you don't know. 26 THE WITNESS: The question one more time, please. 27 BY MR. STEIN: 28

Α. Yes, sir. 1 Could be day shift, could be night shift? 2 0. Usually swing or graveyard, sir. 3 Α. And swing shift are what hours? 4 Q. A. 15:30 to 01:30. 5 And graveyard is what hours? 6 Q. 7 22:00 to 06:00. Α. Now, you've testified that prior to your testimony 8 Ο. here, you have had the opportunity to look and hear at some 9 10 videos; is that correct? 11 Α. Yes, sir. How long after the shooting did you become aware of 12 Ο. 13 the fact that videos exited? I don't remember. 14 How about the morning of the shooting, were you aware 15 of a video exiting at that time? 16 No, I was not. 17 Α. Did you ask members of the BART Police Department if 18 you could look at a video prior to giving your statement the 19 morning of January 1st, 2009? 20 I asked for the platform cameras, yes. 21 And your purpose for doing that what was? 22 To help me refresh my recollection of the chain of 23 events that took place that morning. 24 Did you have any other purpose for looking at that 25 Q. video? 26 27 Α. No, sir. Were you given that opportunity? 28 Q.

- A. No, sir.
- Q. Now, when you were first interviewed, that was at the BART Police Department. Who was present for that interview?
- A. If I remember correctly, I believe it was Detective Enriquez, Detective McNack, and I don't remember who else from the BART Police Department. I believe there were two attorneys there from the Mastagni Law Firm.
  - Q. Does the name David Mastagni sound familiar?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. Do you remember a David Mastagni being present?
- A. I believe there's a senior and a junior, and I think junior was the one who was present. I'm not certain.
  - Q. Do you remember a Daniel McNamara being present?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. Do you know who that is?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. Who is that?
  - A. The other attorney.
  - Q. So you had two lawyers with you at that time?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Now, three days after you gave that statement, you participated in what I will refer to as a walkthrough at the Fruitvale BART platform; is that correct?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And the following people were present: Was Lieutenant Lucarelli there, if you remember?
  - A. I don't remember.
  - Q. How about Lieutenant Alkire?

	1	A.	Yes. I remember him, sir.
	2	Q.	Sergeant Fueng?
	3	A.	Yes, sir.
	4	Q.	Detective Smith?
	5	Α.	Yes, sir.
	6	Q.	Detective Maes?
	7	A.	Yes, sir.
	8	Q.	Detective Enriquez?
	9	A.	Yes.
	10	Q.	Detective McNack?
	11	A.	Yes.
	12	Q.	And attorney Daniel McNamara?
	13	A.	Yes, sir.
~~~ <sub>~</sub>	14	Q.	All those people were present on the Fruitvale BART
	15	station	at the Fruitvale BART station on the platform for
	16	this walkt	hrough; is that correct?
	17	A.	Yes, sir.
	18		THE COURT: Mr. Stein, hold on one second, okay.
	19		(Pause.)
	20		THE COURT: Go ahead.
	21		BY MR. STEIN:
	22	Q.	With regard to this walkthrough that took place on
	23	the 4th of	January 2009, you, your attorney and a number of
	24	other peopl	le from BART were present on the platform; is that
	25	right?	
	26	Α.	Yes, sir.
	27	Q.	And your understanding of the purpose of this meeting
	28	on the plat	form was what?

Α. To assist with the investigation. 1 And how were you personally going to do that? 2 0. 3 Answer questions. Α. 4 Ο. And were you going to describe to them what took 5 place at the time of the shooting? 6 Α. Yes. 7 And was it your intention to provide as much Q. information as you could to these investigators? 8 Yes, it was. 9 Α. Was it your intention to be as accurate and as 10 0. 11 truthful and as forthcoming as one could possibly be? Absolutely. 12 Α. 13 Ο. And were you? A. As best as I could at the time, sir. 14 Now, on January 26th of 2009, you were interviewed 15 Q. again here at the Alameda County DA's office; is that correct? 16 Α. Yes, sir. 17 And among the people present for that interview, was 18 0. Mr. William Rapoport; is that correct? 19 Yes, sir. 20 Α. He is your attorney now; is that correct? 21 0. Α. Yes, sir. 22 And was he present with us last week when you 23 Q. testified? 24 25 Α. Yes, sir. 26 Q. Is he present here today? Α. Yes, sir. 27 And when you gave the statement on January 26th of 28 Q.

2009, again, your purpose was to answer questions and provide 1 information as best you could to assist in the investigation of 2 3 the shooting death of Oscar Grant; is that correct? Α. Yes, sir. 4 And as best you could you did that, is that your 5 Ο. 6 testimony? Yes, sir. 7 Α. Now, on March 17, 2009, you again provided a 8 0. statement, a recorded statement, to investigators from BART; is 9 that right? 10 11 Α. Yes, sir. And Sergeant Fueng was one of those investigators? 12 Q. Α. Yes, sir. 13 And was Lieutenant Alkire present? 14 Ο. Yes, sir. 15 Α. 16 Q. And what about your attorney, Mr. Rapoport, was he 17 also present? Yes, sir. Α. 18 And again you were asked questions about what took 19 place on the night that Oscar Grant was killed; is that correct? 20 It was the morning, correct? Α. 21 Q. Yeah, it was the early morning hours of January 1st. 22 Yes, sir. Α. 23 And you did everything you could to provide as much 24 ο. information as possible in terms of what took place on the 25 platform at that time; is that right? 26 Α. Yes, sir. 27

28

Q.

And when prior to giving that statement, you were

given an opportunity to review and listen to your prior statements that you had given; is that correct?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And you were also given a supplemental report authored by a Detective Maes which described the events that took place at the walkthrough; is that correct?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. And you reviewed that report as well?
  - A. I believe so, sir.
  - Q. Okay.

MR. STEIN: Your Honor, I have marked before for identification four transcripts and a supplemental report. They are marked 34 through 38, and I would ask permission to lay these out so Officer Pirone can refer to them during his testimony, if necessary.

The record should also reflect that each transcript is numbered at the top, Transcript 1, Transcript 2, Transcript 3, Transcript 3A, and then finally the supplemental report.

THE COURT: All right.

MR. STEIN: We'll leave those there for now. And I have copies for counsel.

- Q. Now, you have testified, sir, that on occasion you have seen some videos. Is it your testimony that you don't know how many videos that you've seen?
  - A. That's correct, sir.
  - O. Could it be more or less than two?
  - A. I would guess more than two.
  - Q. More or less than five?

27

28

video tape and it has this legal analyst by the name of Michael Cardoza commenting on the video?

- Correct, sir.
- So did you ever watch any videos in any of your attorney's office?
  - Yes, sir.
- And when you watched those videos, did they have
  - Some did, sir, yes.
- And with regard to the sound that you heard, did any of the sound that you heard refresh your memory of what you heard the night that this took place?
  - No, it did not, sir.
- So your testimony here today is based entirely on your independent recollection of what you heard as opposed to being influenced by any video or audio; is that correct?
  - Yes, sir.
- You have testified to various things that I would describe as very detailed. And what I'm referring to are times when you say you took your right hand and grabbed a person on their left shoulder and then -- you know, you're very specific. Is that all based on your independent recollection or were you assisted by watching the events as they unfolded on video?
  - Some of them were statements, sir.
- Now, when you got this call, you were downstairs in, I think you said, the free area; is that right?
  - That's correct, sir. Α.
  - The initial call that you received was a fight on the Q.

lead car; is that correct? 1 2 Α. Correct, sir. And you have said before that when you first got that 3 Ο. initial report, that the call came out as not only a fight on 4 the lead car, but a fight on the lead car with five African 5 6 males; isn't that true? 7 I believe they were specified as black males. But you have described the call as it came out in a Q. 8 prior statement as it being a fight on the lead car with five 9 African males; is that true? 10 That was from my recollection of the radio 11 transmission, that's correct. 12 Since this incident, have you heard the radio 13 transmission? 14 Yes, I have. 15 Α. And where were you when you heard the radio 16 Ο. transmission? 17 My attorney's office, sir. 18 Α. Your attorney played it for you? 19 Q. Yes, sir. 20 Α. Which attorney? 21 Ο. 22 Α. I'm sorry? Which attorney? 23 Q. Bill Rapoport. 24 Α. Did he tell you how he got his hands on the recording 25 Q. of that transmission? 26 27 MR. RAINS: Objection. Calls for a privileged communication. 28

THE COURT: Overruled. 1 2 BY MR. STEIN: Did Mr. Rapoport show you any transcripts of any 3 other witnesses who provided statements in this investigation? 4 Calls for a privileged communication. 5 MR. RAINS: THE COURT: Overruled. You can answer. 6 What was the question again? 7 THE WITNESS: 8 BY MR. STEIN: Did Mr. Rapoport show you any transcripts of any 9 Q. statements that were given by other witnesses during this 10 investigation? 11 12 Α. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Whose transcripts did he show you? There are a lot, sir. I don't have them memorized. 14 Α. Did you ask to look at what other people said in 15 Ο. their statements? 16 Calls for a privilege communication of MR. RAINS: 17 counsel. 18 Not whether or not he asked to look at it 19 THE COURT: or not, whatever the contents might be. So it's overruled. 20 THE WITNESS: No, I don't remember. 21 22 BY MR. STEIN: Did you listen to any statements that were given by Q. 23 other individuals pertaining to this investigation? 24 25 Α. No, sir. So you just read their recorded transcripts; is that 26 right? 27 28 Α. Yes, sir.

ο. And how long ago was it that you did that? 1 I don't remember. 2 Α. Has it been in the last week? 3 Ο. No, sir. 4 Α. 0. Within the last month? 5 Δ. I don't know. 6 Could possibly be within the last month? 7 Ο. I don't know. 8 Α. And on how many occasions have you looked at 9 Ο. 10 transcripts? Was it one occasion or more than one? There were more than one transcripts. I'm not really 11 12 understanding your question. Well, let me ask you this way: Did you ever look at 13 14 these transcripts at your house? 15 A. Yes. So you have your own copy? 16 Q. 17 Α. Some. What about the videos? You got your own copy of the 18 0. videos? 19 Whatever you can download off the internet. 20 Α. What about what you saw in your attorney's office? 21 Q. What I saw in my attorney's office, the video 22 Α. there was on the internet. 23 And with regard to these dispatched communications, 24 0. the radio calls, do you have access to those at your house? 25 26 Α. Transcripts? 0. Yes. 27 Yes, sir. 28 Α.

A. Yes, I am. 1 2 Ο. 3 4 wearing. 5 6 7 8 9 white tennis shoes." 10 11 12 13 Α. 14 Ο. My question is --15 Α. 16 0. 17 Α. Yes, sir. 18 19 Ο. 20 out to you initially, true? 21 22 Α. 23 Q. Yes. Yes, sir. 24 Α. 25 Q. that train, were there not? 26

27

28

Α.

Q.

I didn't count.

Can you look down to lines 21 to 25. I'm going to ask you if this refreshes your recollection as to what he was "Question: And can you describe the suspect, including his clothes, Mr. Pirone? "Answer: An African male, approximately 5'8" maybe 160-170 pounds, wearing a red T-shirt and, I think, a white one underneath and blue jeans and, I think, Does that refresh your recollection as to what you believe Oscar Grant was wearing when you set foot on the platform? Apparently, that's what I said this day. On the 7th or -- I'm sorry -- the 1st. Does that refresh your recollection as to what you believed he was wearing when you first set foot on the platform? And so Oscar Grant, at least with regard to his clothing description, did not match the radio call that was sent In the clothing department? There were several, several African-American males on

Would you say that there were many?

Α. On the train? 1 2 Ο. Yes. I didn't look on the train. 3 Α. How about on the platform? 4 Q. 5 Α. There were five males and one female coming at me on 6 the platform. Weren't there other people on the platform that you 7 Ο. saw after you first set foot on the platform? 8 No, there was not. 9 Α. You never saw anyone else on the platform? 10 0. No, sir. 11 Α. 12 Q. You're sure of that? From what I remember. 13 Α. Now, initially when you approached these five men, 14 0. you saw fit to withdraw your Taser; is that correct? 15 16 Α. Yes, sir. And what had any of these men done that caused you to 17 Q. draw your Taser at that point in time? 18 19 A. Nothing. 20 Ο. And so they didn't threaten you? Not at first, no. 21. Α. They didn't threaten you verbally? 22 Q. No, sir. 23 Α. But you saw fit to pull your Taser nonetheless? 24 Q. Yes, sir. 25 Α. And that was based in part on the radio call that you 26 Q. got and that these five individuals appeared to be together; is 27 that right? 28

That

I was outnumbered, yes, sir. Α. 1 And your specific recollection is that when you 2 Ο. received the initial call, you remember the number five; is that 3 right? 4 5 Α. Yes. Now, when you took your Taser out of its holster, you 6 0. 7 turned the safety switch to the armed position, correct? Α. Yes, sir. 8 And as you've testified, that causes a light and a 9 Q. laser to shine from the Taser weapon, correct? 10 11 A. Yes, sir. Now, as you approach this group, one of the 12 Ο. 13 individuals tried to get around you; is that right? There were three of them, sir. 14 Α. Well, one of them you put your hands on, correct? 15 Ο. Yes, sir. 16 Α. That's the one I want to focus on right now. 17 0. person tried to go around you, correct? 18 19 Α. Yes, sir. And you took your hand and you grabbed him by the 20 Q. 21 chest; is that right? I put it on his chest, sir. 22 Α. Okay. Did you take hold of his clothing? 23 Q. No, I did not, sir. 24 Α. Was your palm open when you put it against his chest? 25 Q. Α. Yes, sir. 26 And your purpose for doing that was what? 27 0. To gain his attention. 28 A.

	1	Q.	And did you get his attention?
	2	A.	Not at first, sir.
	3	Q.	What happened?
	4	A.	As far as?
	5	Q.	After you put your hand on his chest, what happened?
	6	A.	I instructed him to have a seat against the wall.
	7	Q.	And then what happened? Did he comply with that
	8	request?	
	9	Α.	No, he did not.
	10	Q.	Where did he go?
	11	А.	He did not go anywhere. He continued to push against
	12	my hand li	ke if he was going to continue walking.
	13	Q.	Approximately how tall was this individual?
1	14	A.	Somewhere between 5'8" and 6 foot.
المد	15	Q.	Approximately how much did this person weigh?
	16	A.	180 to 200 pounds.
	17	Q.	How tall are you?
	18	A.	6 foot.
	19	Q.	And you told us that you weighed, with your duty
	20	belt, appr	oximately 250 pounds. Without your duty belt, how
	21	much do yo	u weigh?
	22	A.	225 pounds.
	23	Q.	Now, were you able to stop this individual from
	24	walking pa	st you?
	25	A.	With a little bit of force, yes, sir.
4,	26	Q.	How much force?
	27	A.	Using my hand and a little bit of muscle.
	28	Q.	Now, your testimony is you just put your hand up

against his chest with your five fingers out stretched; is that 1 right? 2 That's correct. 3 Α. You have a specific recollection of that; is that 4 Ο. 5 right? Αİ Yes. 6 7 ο. Okay. Now, after you put your hand on his chest and told him again to go against the wall, did he comply at that time? 9 10 Α. No, he did not. 11 0. Then what happened? 12 Α. I threatened to tase him. What did you say? 13 Q. I said, "I will tase you if you don't sit down." 14 Α. And then did he comply? 15 Q. Somewhat. 16 Α. When you say somewhat, was does that mean? 17 0. He looked at me with a puzzled look like if he was 18 Α. shocked I was talking to him, and I told him to have a seat 19 20 again. What are the other individuals doing while you're 21 Q. 22 dealing with this one individual? They stopped in their tracks. 2.3 Α. This individual who you were dealing with, that was 24 Q. not Oscar Grant, correct? 25 No, it was not. 26 Α. It was one of the people you saw him with, correct? 27 Q. 28 Yes, it was. Α.

So at that time did that individual sit down against Ο. 1 2 the wall? I remember correctly, yes. 3 Α. What about the other individuals who he was with? 4 Ο. I instructed them to sit down again --5 Α. And did they? 6 ο. -- also, and they did. 7 Α. And what did you do after all these, I think, five 8 0. individuals -- right? How many sat down next to the wall? 9 When are we in time? I'm lost. 10 Α. We haven't moved at all. We're still -- you stopped 11 Ο. 12 the one individual with your hand and you tell him --You jumped forward because my initial contact was 13 with all of them. Oscar Grant and Michael Greer jumped on the 14 That was my initial contact with all of them. 15 16 Ο. Okay. And then when I addressed the individual that I put 17 Α. my hand on, there were only three left because, again, Michael 18 Greer and Oscar Grant jumped on the train, sir. 19 So when the three sat down -- right? 20 Ο. Α. Yes, sir. 21 Did they all sit along the wall together? 22 Q. Yes, sir. 23 Α. Did you tell them, you know, "Keep your hands where I 24 Q. can see them"? 25 I said keep their hands out of their pockets. 26 Α. Did they? 27 Q.

Yes, sir.

Α.

<u>)</u>	1	Q.	They complied with that order?		
	2	A.	Yes, sir.		
	3	Q.	Now, this is all prior to Officer Domenici ever		
	4	setting foot on the platform, as far as you know, correct?			
	5	Α.	Correct.		
	6	Q.	So when Officer Domenici arrives, what did you do?		
	7	Did you giv	ve her any directions?		
	8	Α.	I instructed her to watch the three against the wall.		
	9	Q.	Now, before she arrived first of all, how did you		
	10	get into co	ommunication with her?		
	11	Α.	I used my radio.		
	12	Q.	And what did you say on your radio?		
	13	Α.	I asked her to 98 with me up on the platform.		
and A	14	Q.	And 98 means meet with me?		
)	15	Α.	Yes, sir.		
	16	Q.	And you heard that radio communication since this		
	17	incident, d	correct?		
	18	Α.	Well, the TAC channel doesn't get recorded. So I		
	19	haven't heard the transmission.			
	20	Q.	You don't hear yourself saying, "Officer Domenici, 98		
	21	me upstairs	3"?		
	22	A.	That's correct. I did not hear that.		
	23	Q.	And so how long does it take for her to get to your		
	24	position af	ter you make that radio communication with her?		
	25	A.	Couple of minutes.		
	26	Q.	Okay. And during those couple of minutes, the three		
`\	27	individuals are still seated against the wall, correct?			
	28	А.	That's correct.		

27

28

1

2

3

4

5

- Q. They're not verbally abusing you, they're not physically threatening, nothing of the sort, true?
  - That's not true.
  - Oh, it's not? Ο.
  - No, it's not. Α.
- Tell me what happens as these three individuals are Ο. seated against wall?
- After I asked for Domenici to meet with me on the Α. platform, I instructed -- I informed them the reason why I was detaining them. I got so far into the conversation as to "We got a report of a fight on the train," and that was it because after I said those words, all of them started shouting out with "We didn't do shit." Excuse me. "Why you fucking with me? you fucking with us?"
  - ο. Did that pose a threat to you?
  - No at the time it did not. Α.
- But these individuals, based on, you know, what had Ο. taken place earlier in the evening with regard to West Oakland and the Embarcadero, you felt that there was a high probability that someone in this group had a gun, true?
  - Α. Yes.
- But when you had these three individuals against the 0. wall, you never searched them, did you?
  - No, I did not. Α.
- You never even asked them if they had weapons, did Ο. you?
  - Α. No, I did not.
  - Why didn't you? Q.

27

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

- I couldn't even get into the sentence of why or the Α. reason for detainment without hearing cursing and other language so I stopped communicating with them all together.
- Why didn't you just stop communicating with them altogether then proceed to pat search them?
  - Because that's not safe.
  - Ο. Why is that not safe?
- Because I'm occupied with one person I don't know and Α. I can't possibly keep track of what two others are doing.
  - Any other reason for not searching them at that time? Ο.
  - Aside from being outnumbered, no, sir. Α.
- Well, then when Officer Domenici arrived, why don't Q. you search them then?
  - We're still outnumbered. Α.
  - Ο. How so?
  - Two police officers, three suspects. Α.
- Is it your testimony, sir, that it is not in accord Q. with policy and procedure to ever search someone if there are more detainees than there are officers?
  - Well, I still don't know what they have, sir. Α.
- That would be the reason to search them because you 0. don't know, correct?
  - Yes. Α.
- So since you don't know and since you are operating 0. under the belief that there is a high probability that someone in this group has a gun, why not ask Officer Domenici to stand back and hold her Taser against these three individuals while you pat search them?

That's a

- A. We're getting misdemeanor from a outside source; is that correct?
- Q. Well, you tell me. What was your source that they were involved --
- A. We're not trained to possibly judge the safety of any call that we ever get based on a classification of the call by a call -- by a reporting party. As a matter of fact, we are trained the exact opposite in the academy to treat everything as it appears.
  - Q. And how did it appear?
- A. Well, at the time, these three were being cooperative in the sense that they weren't reaching in their pockets, they weren't getting up. They did what I asked them to do.
- Q. But you said that they were cursing at you and yelling at you such that you couldn't even proceed with a conversation with them. So how is that cooperative?
- A. Well, the conversation is just that. When you follow it up with violent actions or actions that may be perceived as being violent, that poses a threat.
- Q. So would you say that their verbal conduct was not consistent with their physical conduct? Is that what you're saying?
- A. I'm saying they sat there and cursed at me. They didn't get up. They didn't raise their hands or reach in their pockets of any sort.
- Q. And so I want to ask you again: What were you more concerned with, officer safety in terms of these three

individuals and there being a high probability that one of them had a gun and apprehending two people who got back onto the train who may or may not have been involved in a fight? What was more important to you at that particular time?

- A. To get everybody.
- Q. So which was more important?
- A. To get all the suspects.
- Q. Despite any threat about officer safety; is that correct?
- A. Well, they all kept their hands out where I needed to see them, so they no longer posed a threat.
- Q. Could you not have just pat searched them as they kept their hands out while Officer Domenici stood guard with a Taser?
- A. No. My concern at this point, again, is still the other two that ran from my initial contact. Why would you run from the police?
- Q. Well, you have testified or you have at least said earlier in your statements that there was -- you believed in your mind there was a high probability that these people had guns.

Now, could there be a more dire concern or immediate concern on an officer's part than dealing with subjects who you believe there is a high probability are armed?

MR. RAINS: Let me object to that high probability. I don't know that that was the witness's testimony.

THE COURT: That's what the testimony was.

Overruled. You can answer the question.

THE WITNESS: I need the question again, sir.

BY MR. STEIN:

- Q. Can you think of a more dire scenario or a more serious concern that an officer may have other than dealing with someone who they believe has a gun on them?
- A. Besides the other two that I don't know their location?
  - Q. Yeah.
  - A. No.
- Q. So you would agree with me then that between the two scenarios, you going back on the train and dealing with three individuals who you believe there is a high probability that one of them has a gun, the concern really between those two scenarios is with regard to the people against the wall, the people with the gun, correct?
  - A. Who has the qun?
- Q. Well, you've said before, have you not, that it is your belief that the people you detained you believed there was a high probability that one of them had a gun?

MR. RAINS: That misstates his testimony.

THE COURT: Overruled.

BY MR. STEIN:

- Q. Didn't you say that?
- A. I don't know. Did I?
- Q. Why don't you just grab the first transcript there before you, Transcript 1.
  - A. Uh-huh.
  - Q. You got page 9 there, Transcript 1?

- A. Yes.
- Q. See if this refreshes your recollection. And I'm beginning on line nine.

"Because the other two had gotten on the train and I had my three initial suspects, and I gave them instructions to keep their hands where I could see them because, again, I'm thinking there's a high probability of somebody who's got a gun."

Does that refresh your recollection as to what your mental state was in terms of these people possibly having guns?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And so is it true that when you stopped them, you believed that there was a high probability that one of the people in that group had a gun, true?
  - A. Sure.
- Q. Okay. And so despite this belief, you thought that it would be okay for you to leave your partner, right, with these three individuals -- by the way, did you tell your partner that these people had not been searched?
  - A. I believe so.
- Q. Did you tell them that they hadn't been pat searched at all as opposed to gone through their pockets?
  - A. Then that would be an illegal search, sir.
- Q. Okay. Did you tell her, your partner, whether or not you conducted any search?
  - A. I said, "They're un-searched. Watch them."
- Q. And what do you think now looking back about the wisdom of leaving your partner with three individuals who you

believe there's a high probability one of them had a gun?

MR. RAINS: Objection. Irrelevant.

THE COURT: Overruled.

THE WITNESS: Again, the question.

BY MR. STEIN:

- Q. The question is: Now that since you're able to look back and think about the events that took place, what do you think about the wisdom of leaving your partner there with three individuals about whom you believe there's a high probability one of them has a gun while you go back onto the train and look for two people who may have been involved in a fight?
  - A. Well, they too might also have a firearm.
  - Q. Okay. And you believe that, true?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And so you were willing to leave your partner with those three individuals under those circumstances?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Now, when you first got onto the platform, you walked towards these individuals as these individuals walked towards you, right?
  - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And isn't it true that before you even spoke to any of these people, that the two individuals went back onto the platform?
  - A. I'm sorry. The question one more time.
- Q. The question is: Isn't it true that before you even spoke to the group of men on the platform, two individuals went back on to the train?